## Challenges in OTU

 CLUSTERING
## Robert Edgar

Independent scientist<br>robert@drive5.com<br>www.drive5.com

## OTUs: Huse "dot plots"



## Challenges in OTU clustering

Ambiguous assignments


Which OTU?

## Challenges in OTU clustering

Abundant sequences $<3 \%$ different


## Challenges in OTU clustering

Abundant sequences $<3 \%$ different

Outliners create spurious OTU(s)


## Challenges in OTU clustering

Full-length 16S gene (~1500nt)


## Challenges in OTU clustering

Full-length 16S gene (~1500nt)
Next-gen reads of hypervariable region (~300nt)


Variation greater in short
region, may be $>3 \%$.

## Challenges in OTU clustering

## Variation between populations



Healthy


Diseased

## Challenges in OTU clustering

## Variation between populations



## Challenges in OTU clustering

## Paralogs and segmental duplications



## Challenges in OTU clustering

Alignment variation and defining \% identity
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}G & \mathbf{A} & \mathbf{T} & \mathbf{T} & \mathbf{A} & \mathbf{C} & \mathbf{A} & - & - \\ \mathbf{G} & \mathbf{A} & \mathbf{A} & \mathbf{T} & \mathbf{T} & \mathbf{A} & \mathbf{A} & \mathbf{C} & \mathbf{A}\end{array}$
3 diffs or 5 diffs?
$\mathbf{G A} \boldsymbol{A} \mathbf{T} \mathbf{T} \mathbf{A}-\mathbf{C} \mathbf{A}$
GAATTAACA
No diffs or 2 diffs?


Different programs produce different results from the same algorithm \& same input data because alignments and \%id definition vary. This can bias validation, e.g. Schloss \& Westcott (2011) AEM.

## Challenges in OTU clustering

Hard to define an OTU or an optimal set of OTUs


## Challenges in OTU clustering

Hard to define an OTU or an optimal set of OTUs


## Challenges in OTU clustering

- OTUs are hacks
- Do not exist in nature
- Cannot be defined and validated robustly
- But can still be useful!

